

## Safety from False Convictions

# Safety from False Convictions

Boaz Sangero

*To Professor Rinat Kitai-Sangero, the spirit of my writing.*

# Contents

Acknowledgments xi

*Introduction* xiii

## *1. The Need for Safety in the Criminal Justice System* 1

I. General 1

II. False Convictions Do Occur, and at an Unrecognized High Rate 2

a. False Convictions Happen 2

b. The False-Conviction Rate Based on the Criminal Standard of Proof 6

c. Estimating the False-Conviction Rate Based on Empirical Data 8

d. Summary 13

III. The Moral Duty to Adopt Safety Measures in the Criminal Justice System 14

IV. Economic Justification for Investing in Safety in the Criminal Justice System 19

V. Possible Objections 22

## *2. Fundamentals of Modern System-Safety* 27

I. The History of System-Safety 27

II. Basic Definitions 33

III. System-Safety Process: Identify, Analyze, Control 34

IV. Risk Assessment 35

V. Fundamental Safety Concepts 36

VI. Common Methods of System-Safety 38

VII. Redundancy 41

VIII. The Requirement to Report Accidents and Incidents (Near Accidents) 43

IX. System-Safety Engineering Versus “Black-Box” Testing 46

X. Safety in Medical Diagnostic Devices 48

XI. “Stamp”—System-Theoretic Accident Model and Processes 50

XII. Summary 52

## *3. Safety in the Criminal Justice System—General Principles* 53

I. General 53

II. Defining Safety in the Criminal Justice System 53

III. The Hidden Accidents Principle in Criminal Law 55

IV. Why a Single Piece of Evidence Should not be Sufficient for a Conviction: Bayes’ Theorem and Medical Diagnostics 57

a. General 57

b. Bayes’ Theorem as Odds 58

c. Applying Bayes’ Theorem in the Criminal Justice System 60

- d. Insights and Lessons from the Field of Medical Diagnostics 64
- V. Adjusting the Beyond-a-Reasonable-Doubt Standard to a Safety Doctrine 65
- VI. Neutralizing the Conception of the Suspect’s Guilt: Insights from Psychology 67
- VII. Pursuing the Ultimate Goal of Gathering and Submitting Accurate Evidence 74
- VIII. Starting with “Fly-Fix-Fly” 75

4. *Applying Modern Safety in the Criminal Justice System* 79

- I. General 79
- II. The Establishment of a “Safety in the Criminal Justice System Institute” (SCJSI) 80
- III. Accident (False Conviction) and Incident Reporting Duties 85
- IV. Safety Education and Training and a Culture of Safety 88
- V. Identify-Analyze-Control in the Criminal Justice System 90
- VI. An Ongoing Process of Improvement 96
- VII. Redundancy 97
- VIII. Summary 99

5. *Safety in Specific Types of Evidence* 101

- I. General 101
- II. UnSafety in Forensic Sciences Evidence 102
  - a. General 102
  - b. The Admissibility of Forensic Sciences Evidence: From *Frye* to *Daubert* 102
  - c. The Weight of Forensic Sciences Evidence: From “Uniqueness,” “Individualization,” and “Perfection” to Empirical and Probabilistic Foundation 105
  - d. DNA Testing 111
  - e. Fingerprint Comparisons 123
  - f. “Junk Science” as Evidence 137
- III. Safety Measures 150
  - a. Developing Forensic Science Evidence as a Safety-Critical System 150
  - b. Other Safety Changes in Scientific Evidence 151
- IV. Confessions 157
  - a. Current UnSafety 157
  - b. Possible Safety Measures 173
- V. Eyewitness Identification 181
  - a. Current UnSafety 181
  - b. Possible Safety Measures 185

6. *Safety in Criminal Procedures* 195

- I. General 195
- II. Police and Prosecution Negligence and Misconduct 197

- a. Current UnSafety 197
  - b. Possible Safety Measures 205
- III. Plea-Bargains 207
  - a. Current UnSafety 207
  - b. Possible Safety Measures 214
  - c. Applying the STAMP Model to Plea Bargains 220
- IV. Post-Conviction Proceedings 222
  - a. Current UnSafety 222
  - b. Possible Safety Measures 228

*Conclusion* 233

# Acknowledgments

I would like to thank Professor Rinat Kitai-Sangero, who helped me during all the years of the work on this book and who made this book possible. Her remarks and suggestions regarding each draft were a tremendous contribution.

I am also grateful to Professor Alex Stein and Dr. Daniel Hartmann for their support and advice, and Ms. Dana Rothman-Meshulam for her super professional editing work.

Boaz Sangero  
Jerusalem, Israel  
2016