Safety from False Convictions
Safety from False Convictions

Boaz Sangero
To Professor Rinat Kitai-Sangero, the spirit of my writing.
Contents

Acknowledgments xi
Introduction xiii

1. The Need for Safety in the Criminal Justice System 1
   I. General 1
   II. False Convictions Do Occur, and at an Unrecognized High Rate 2
      a. False Convictions Happen 2
      b. The False-Conviction Rate Based on the Criminal Standard of Proof 6
      c. Estimating the False-Conviction Rate Based on Empirical Data 8
      d. Summary 13
   III. The Moral Duty to Adopt Safety Measures in the Criminal Justice System 14
   IV. Economic Justification for Investing in Safety in the Criminal Justice System 19
   V. Possible Objections 22

2. Fundamentals of Modern System-Safety 27
   I. The History of System-Safety 27
   II. Basic Definitions 33
   III. System-Safety Process: Identify, Analyze, Control 34
   IV. Risk Assessment 35
   V. Fundamental Safety Concepts 36
   VI. Common Methods of System-Safety 38
   VII. Redundancy 41
   VIII. The Requirement to Report Accidents and Incidents (Near Accidents) 43
   IX. System-Safety Engineering Versus “Black-Box” Testing 46
   X. Safety in Medical Diagnostic Devices 48
   XI. “Stamp”—System-Theoretic Accident Model and Processes 50
   XII. Summary 52

3. Safety in the Criminal Justice System—General Principles 53
   I. General 53
   II. Defining Safety in the Criminal Justice System 53
   III. The Hidden Accidents Principle in Criminal Law 55
   IV. Why a Single Piece of Evidence Should not be Sufficient for a Conviction: Bayes’
      Theorem and Medical Diagnostics 57
      a. General 57
      b. Bayes’ Theorem as Odds 58
      c. Applying Bayes’ Theorem in the Criminal Justice System 60
d. Insights and Lessons from the Field of Medical Diagnostics 64
V. Adjusting the Beyond-a-Reasonable-Doubt Standard to a Safety Doctrine 65
VI. Neutralizing the Conception of the Suspect’s Guilt: Insights from Psychology 67
VII. Pursuing the Ultimate Goal of Gathering and Submitting Accurate Evidence 74
VIII. Starting with “Fly-Fix-Fly” 75

4. Applying Modern Safety in the Criminal Justice System 79
   I. General 79
   II. The Establishment of a “Safety in the Criminal Justice System Institute” (SCJSI) 80
   III. Accident (False Conviction) and Incident Reporting Duties 85
   IV. Safety Education and Training and a Culture of Safety 88
   V. Identify-Analyze-Control in the Criminal Justice System 90
   VI. An Ongoing Process of Improvement 96
   VII. Redundancy 97
   VIII. Summary 99

5. Safety in Specific Types of Evidence 101
   I. General 101
   II. Unsafety in Forensic Sciences Evidence 102
      a. General 102
      b. The Admissibility of Forensic Sciences Evidence: From Frye to Daubert 102
      c. The Weight of Forensic Sciences Evidence: From “Uniqueness,” “Individualization,” and “Perfection” to Empirical and Probabilistic Foundation 105
      d. DNA Testing 111
      e. Fingerprint Comparisons 123
      f. “Junk Science” as Evidence 137
   III. Safety Measures 150
      a. Developing Forensic Science Evidence as a Safety-Critical System 150
      b. Other Safety Changes in Scientific Evidence 151
   IV. Confessions 157
      a. Current UnSafety 157
      b. Possible Safety Measures 173
   V. Eyewitness Identification 181
      a. Current UnSafety 181
      b. Possible Safety Measures 185

6. Safety in Criminal Procedures 195
   I. General 195
   II. Police and Prosecution Negligence and Misconduct 197
a. Current UnSafety 197
b. Possible Safety Measures 205

III. Plea-Bargains 207
   a. Current UnSafety 207
   b. Possible Safety Measures 214
   c. Applying the STAMP Model to Plea Bargains 220

IV. Post-Conviction Proceedings 222
   a. Current UnSafety 222
   b. Possible Safety Measures 228

Conclusion 233
Acknowledgments

I would like to thank Professor Rinat Kitai-Sangero, who helped me during all the years of the work on this book and who made this book possible. Her remarks and suggestions regarding each draft were a tremendous contribution.

I am also grateful to Professor Alex Stein and Dr. Daniel Hartmann for their support and advice, and Ms. Dana Rothman-Meshulam for her super professional editing work.

Boaz Sangero
Jerusalem, Israel
2016